

~~SECRET~~

GOVERNMENT OF INDIA

PART File No. C/125/18/69/JP

Volume

Ministry of External Affairs

Department of

East Asia Division SECTION

NOTES/CORRESPONDENCE

Subject

Resolution in Lok Sabha tabled by Shri Benoy Krishna Daschowdhury -- Case for instituting an Enquiry Commission about the mysterious disappearance of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose. (for 29-8-1969)--

(Main file transferred to MHA)

Recorded.

notes corr. p. 1-3.
corr. p. no 1-9
page no 1-3)

C. Dentry In.....

C-1986

noted In Sectional Note Book

Copy of S. O./Supt.

Copy of C...

16/3/83

28/9/83 (JIC)
Under Secretary
Ministry of External Affairs

be retained for 3 years

12/9/83

41648

Previous References

DECLASSIFIED

DECLASSIFIED

ORR

[Handwritten signature]

Keep

Dec

16/12/15
Later References
1985
NATIONAL ARCHIVES
INDIA
12/9/83
USC

D. 522/RM/85

(गौतम गुप्ता)
(GAUTAM GUPTA)
उप सचिव (अंतरिम)
Dy. Secy (Adm)
विदेश विभाग, नई दिल्ली
Ministry of External Affairs
New Delhi

Unbleached

MOST IMMEDIATE
PARLIAMENT RESOLUTION

P.F. C/125/18/69/JP

MINISTRY OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS
(East Asia Division)

.....

SRO ① -

J.R. P/c

Reference Private Member's Resolution in the Lok Sabha on Friday the 29th August, 1969, regarding the appointment of an Enquiry Commission presided over by a Judge of the Supreme Court relating to the disappearance of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose since August, 1945.

2. Since this is a matter which has been handled in the past by this Ministry, we might accept the transfer from the Ministry of Home Affairs and deal with it.

3. A self-contained brief on the subject is placed below. Government have all along resisted the demand for holding a further enquiry into the death of Netaji. Nevertheless, the demand has persisted. Whenever any information relating to Netaji is brought to our notice, we have investigated and informed the House of our findings. It would, therefore, be correct to say that Government have invariably investigated all such information and have not closed their mind. Government's stand therefore seems to be that while we continue to check and investigate every information that is brought to our notice, institution of an enquiry commission is not warranted until some tangible evidence is adduced.

4. This is not entirely a procedural or legal matter and political considerations are involved. The Home Minister in the course of a discussion in the Lok Sabha on 22.8.1969 has stated that the demand for a fresh enquiry in the matter is under active consideration of the Government. Government may therefore in view of the persistent demands reconsider its position and agree to a further enquiry. Perhaps some of the Members of the Parliament who have been consistently demanding a further probe could be asked to undertake further investigations to satisfy themselves. Government could perhaps render them necessary facilities for the purpose. If they bring out some tangible evidence, the matter could then be investigated more thoroughly. However, it is extremely unlikely that after 24 years they will be able to establish that Netaji is in fact alive. They might only succeed in showing some doubts on some of the findings of the Shah Nawaz Khan Committee.

5. F.S. may, therefore, kindly obtain F.M.'s orders. We are required to supply 12 copies of the brief to the Department of Parliamentary Affairs for consideration by the Cabinet Committee on Parliamentary Affairs, by Monday the 25th August, 1969.

Sd/-

(Manjit Singh)
Director (East Asia)
24.8.69.

F.S.

List of Parl. Enq. on Netaji - SRO (2) Addl P2/c-3/c

84 A (Copy) No. 325 of 29/8/68 in R.S. - SRO (3) Addl P2/c-14/c

The above note, with J.S.'s & J.M.'s initials, was sent to Secy, M.H.A. on our main file No.C/125/18/69/JP on 27.8.69, for taking further necessary action on the Resolution. The M.H.A. have retained our file and

✓ 2 copies at
SRO ⑥ & ⑦

Original on main file
sent to M.H.A.

25/8/69

main file sent to Secy.
M.H.A. on 27/8/69.

Spoken to P.A. to
F.S.

GA
3.9.69

A.W.F.S.

(from prepage)

9

- 2 -

have informed us, when we asked for our file, that the file in question has been transferred to them. As such it would not be possible to return the file. OSD (EA) was informed of the position & he also checked up the position with his counterpart in the MHA. When these papers were required by Jn. Secretary in connection with the Cabinet Meeting, held on 5th September, 1969, (vide SNo. (24) and SNo (25) of file No. C/551/4/69/JR).

18/9/69

Note on Removal of Netaji's ashes from Rankeji Temple - SNo (4) Added P. 15-16/c
 Press Report 23/9/69 Ind. Express - SNo (5) Added P. 17/c

2 Copies of Brief on "Disappearance of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose" } SNos (6) and (7) P. 18-27/c
 referred to in Para 2 on prepage } Added

D. 10624 SA D / 69 _____ SNo (8) Added P. 28-30/c
 D. 10805 SA D / 69 _____ SNo (9) Added P 31/c

3

Extract from file No. F.29/48/69-Poll.II
of the Ministry of Home Affairs - Poll. II Section.
.....

XXXXXX XXXXXX XXXXXX XXXXXX

Prime facie there is no case for a fresh enquiry commission in view of the findings of the Shah Nawaz Commission. However, as this question arouses strong feelings in the country, and has political implications, F.M. may like to consult P.M.

Sd. T.N. Kaul
24.8.69

F/M.

This is regarding an internal political situation, which can best be decided by the Home Ministry. At best we can be asked regarding position abroad on which we can give our advice. But the decision has to be political.

Sd. Dinesh Singh
26.8.69

F/s

Sd. T.N. Kaul
26.8.69

DE/s

Secretary MHA may kindly see.

Sd. Manjit Singh
26.8.69

Ministry of Home Affairs (Shri L.P. Singh, Secy.)
M.E.A. UO NO. C/125/18/69/JP, dated the 26th Aug. 69

HM may see from prepage:

2. If the intention is that a Commission of Inquiry may be appointed, the draft note placed below will end with a statement to this effect.

3. Presumably, if an inquiry is to be made the Commission will consist of a single judge of the Supreme Court.

HM

Sd. Y.B. Chavan
26.8.69

Sd.

XXXXXXX XXXXXXX XXXXXXX XXXXXXX

This file should appropriately be deposited with Poll. II Section who have previous papers on the subject. It is understood they also answered some Parliament questions in the past.

US(P/11.I)

Sd.

LOK SABHA

LIST OF BUSINESS

Friday, August 29, 1969 | Bhadra 7, 1891 (Saka)

PART I

GOVERNMENT BUSINESS

A list showing Government Business is being issued separately.

PART II

PRIVATE MEMBERS' BUSINESS

RESOLUTIONS

1. FURTHER DISCUSSION of the following Resolution moved by Shrimati Tarkeshwari Sinha on the 1st August, 1969:—

"This House resolves that in order to achieve socialistic pattern of society which is the declared policy of the Government, necessary steps such as (a) nationalisation of foreign trade, general insurance and steel industry; (b) taking over of all foreign investment in India; (c) fixing of ceiling on urban property; and (d) eradication of black money through demonetisation of the currency be taken by the Government without any further delay."

Nationalisation of foreign trade, general insurance, etc.

Almost over.

[ALSO further discussion of the amendments (printed on separate list) moved by Sarvashri Shiva Chandra Jha, J. M. Lobo Prabhu, B. P. Mandal, George Fernandes, Yashpal Singh and Abdul Ghani Dar on the 14th August, 1969.]

2. SHRI JYOTIRMOY BOSU to move the following Resolution:—

"This House expresses its grave concern at the unprecedented increase in unemployment in the country and failure of the Plans to create adequate employment potential and recommends immediate formulation of a high power All Party Parliamentary Committee to tackle the problem immediately and frame rules for operating National Financial Assistance Scheme for the unemployed."

Unemployment.

2 hrs

3. SHRI N. G. RANGA to move the following Resolution:—

"In view of the rapid spread of violence and violent guerilla activities of the Naxalites and the support derived by them from several sections of the Communists, the Government should take concrete steps in co-operation with and also in addition to whatever the concerned State Governments can and are willing to do in order to protect life, property and Fundamental Rights of the people of India, and simultaneously execute socio-economic development works for uplifting the conditions of adivasis and agricultural workers."

Naxalites.

2 hrs

4. SHRI BENOY KRISHNA DASCHOWDHURY to move the following Resolution:—

"This House is of opinion that in view of the serious discrepancy in the Shah Nawaz Enquiry Committee Report and in the absence of any positive evidence about the death of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose, there is a clear case for instituting an Enquiry Commission presided over by a Judge of the Supreme Court of India about the mysterious disappearance of that great national leader since August, 1945, for setting at rest the various speculations still going on in the country and abroad."

Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose.

1 1/2 hrs

NEW DELHI;

August 25, 1969.

Bhadra 3, 1891 (Saka).

S. L. SHAKDHER,

Secretary.

(2)

5

Parliament Questions on Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose

IN LOK SABHA

1965, 1966 and 1967 and 1968 and 1969

1. Starred Q.No.623 answered on 29-3-65 asking whether the P.M. told pressmen at Varanasi on 27-12-64 that Govt. would investigate whether Netaji was alive and whether Shaulmarhi Ashram Sadhu was Netaji.
2. Starred Question No.729 answered on 29-9-65 regarding resolution passed by Calcutta High Court Bar Association demanding a thorough enquiry into the mystery of death of Netaji and asking for truth about late P.M.'s letters to Shri S.C. Bose that no precise data about Netaji's death is available.
3. Unstarred Question No.2105 answered on 14.3.66 regarding statement by Shri Suresh Chandra Bose in February 1966 at Madurai that Netaji is alive and that he would come in March, 1966.
4. Unstarred Question No.855 answered on 1-8-66 regarding setting up a Commission by the Govt. of Formosa to enquire into the disappearance of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose.
5. Starred Question No.228 answered on 3-4-67 regarding the statement of the retired Japanese Lt. General Fujiwara about a probe into the circumstances surrounding the death of Netaji.
6. Unstarred Q.No.4338 answered on 3.7.67 regarding Taiwan Government's assurance to co-operate in carrying out investigations at Taiwan where Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose is reported to have met his death in air-crash.
7. Starred Question No.1334 answered on 24-7-67 regarding non-visit to Taiwan by the Enquiry Committee headed by Shri Shah Nawaj Khan and demand for fresh enquiry in co-operation with the Government of Taiwan.
8. Starred Question No.582 answered on 11-12-67 regarding Late Prime Minister Jawaharlal Nehru's letter of 13/5/62 to Shri Suresh Chandra Bose expressing inability to send precise proof of the death of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose; and subsequent letter to Shri Amiya Nath Bose about desirability of reaching a finality about Netaji's death.
9. Unstarred Q.No.3719 answered on 11-12-67 regarding General Fujiwara's statement in Calcutta about Japanese co-operation if Govt. of India make any effort to arrive at a finality about Netaji's mystery; H.V. Kamath's visit to Formosa, his statement regarding enquiry being conducted by the Formosa Government about the reported plane crash involving Netaji at Taipei in 1945.

10. Unstarred Q.No.1408 answered on 21-2-69 regarding demand by a large number of MPs for a fresh enquiry into the reported death of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose.
11. Unstarred Q.No.5150 dated 2-4-69 by Shri Samar Guha and Shri Beni Shanker Sharma regarding escape of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose from Singapore.

Assurance given and subsequently a statement was sent to Department of Parliamentary Affairs, vide C/125/5/69/JP dated 26-7-69 in fulfilment of the Assurance.

12. Unstarred Q.No.4192 answered on 20-8-69 regarding a reported broadcast by Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose from Radio Moscow.

RAJYA SABHA

1. Starred Q.No.325 answered on 29/2/68 regarding Memorandum by 350 MPs demanding fresh inquiry into the reported death of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose.
2. Starred Q.No.284 answered on 17-5-66 regarding statement made by Shri Dwijendra Nath Bose that Netaji was alive and that he would come to India in March, 1966.
3. Unstarred Q.No.265 answered on 2-8-66 regarding setting up of a Committee by the Government of Formosa to enquire into the disappearance of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose.
4. Starred Q.No.51, answered on 17-8-65 regarding statement made by Dr. S.N. Sinha, a former M.P., in Calcutta that Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose had been kept in Cell No.46 in a prison in Siberia.

Government of India have already stated in the Parliament several times, in answers to Questions detailed above, that the findings of the Netaji Enquiry Committee, headed by Shri Shah Nawaz Khan, submitted to the Government in 1956 have been accepted by the Government and that there was no necessity to institute a fresh enquiry since the report was conclusive.

==,==,==,==

3

9/12/70/160

7

STARRED QUESTION NO.325

RAJYA SABHA

STARRED QUESTION NO.325

TO BE ANSWERED ON THE 29TH FEBRUARY, 1968

NETAJI SUBHASH CHANDRA BOSE

QUESTION

*No.325 SARDAR NARINDER SINGH BRAR: Will the Prime Minister be pleased to state:

- (a) whether Government have received any memorandum signed by 350 Members of Parliament urging the Union Government to appoint a Committee of Enquiry with collaboration of the Governments of Japan and Taiwan to clear the mystery about Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose; and
- (b) if so, what are the main features of the memorandum and Government's reaction thereto?

.....

ANSWER

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF
EXTERNAL AFFAIRS (SHRI B.R. BHAGAT)

- (a) Yes, Sir.
- (b) Apart from demanding a fresh enquiry into the death of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose the memorandum suggests certain steps to accord due honour and recognition to the personality of Netaji.

Since no new facts have been brought to light, Government do not consider that any further enquiry into the death of Netaji is warranted.

The suggestions for according due honour and recognition to the personality of Netaji are being examined.

NOTE FOR SUPPLEMENTARIES

(On Rajya Sabha Starred Question No. 325 for 29.2.1968)

.....

Memorandum by some 350 M.Ps. for appointing
a fresh Enquiry Committee to investigate
into the death of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose
and according due honour to his personality

A memorandum, said to have been signed by nearly 350 Members of Parliament, was submitted to the President urging that due honour and recognition to the personality and leadership of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose should be accorded by undertaking the following:

1. To place his portrait in the Central Hall of Parliament and all offices of the Government;
2. To erect a statue of Netaji on a prominent site in New Delhi, preferably at India Gate;
3. To devise suitable means to accord national recognition to military genius of Netaji;
4. To observe his birthday every year with due solemnity;
5. To erect suitable memorials at Kohima and Imphal in honour of I.N.A. heroes who sacrificed their lives in the liberation struggle under the leadership of Netaji;
6. To publish the Volume on I.N.A., already written for the "History of Indian Army During the Second War", published by the Government;
7. To give him his due place in the "History of the Freedom Movement" (planned by Government of India). (For this it is necessary to take expert advice on the portion of the manuscript relating to him before it is finally approved for the press).
8. To arrange publication of Netaji's writings and speeches.

The memorandum then goes on to suggest "that a further enquiry be made with the collaboration of the Governments of Japan and Taiwan by a small independent committee consisting of a Judge of the Supreme Court and two or three public men..."

(6)
(9)

Official Enquiry conducted in 1956

In response to the public demand that all the facts relating to the last stages of Netaji's life should be enquired into and made known, an Enquiry Committee was appointed by the Government of India in April, 1956. The Committee consisted of Shri Shah Nawaz Khan, Shri Suresh Chandra Bose (elder brother of Netaji) and Shri S.N. Maitra, Chief Commissioner of Andaman and Nicobar Islands. The report of this Committee, which was signed by Shri Shah Nawaz Khan and Shri S.N. Maitra, was released for publication in September, 1956. The Government of India accepted the report. The conclusion reached by the Enquiry Committee was that Netaji met his death as a result of an air crash at Taihoku airfield in Formosa on August 18, 1945 and that his ashes are now at the Renkoji Temple in Tokyo. However, the third member, namely, Shri Suresh Chandra Bose, did not sign the report. Later on, he submitted a separate report dissenting from the findings of the majority report. After laying a copy of this report on the Table of the House on 11.9.1956, the late Prime Minister, Shri Jawaharlal Nehru, made a statement in the Lok Sabha in which he said inter alia that Government felt that the evidence adduced in the report was practically overwhelming and should be accepted.

Government's attitude to repeated requests for further probes

There have been repeated requests and demands on several occasions for undertaking another enquiry. However, Government having accepted the findings of the Shah Nawaz Committee have taken the view that unless fresh evidence or new facts were brought to light, another enquiry was unwarranted. In the Rajya Sabha itself in 1966, in answer to Starred Question No.284 on 17.5.1966 and again in reply to unstarred question No.265 on 2.8.1966, the Government reiterated this viewpoint. Assertions that Swami Shardanand of the Sholmar

(7)
(10)

Ashram was, in fact, Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose had been denied by the Swami himself. Another claim made by Dr. S.N. Sinha that Netaji was incarcerated in cell No.46 of Yakutusk prison in Siberia has not been corroborated by any tangible evidence. Recently, Lt.-General Fujiwara of Japan, who came to India to present Netaji's sword, requested that the matter should be investigated "once and for all". The General, however, has not produced any evidence which would warrant any further enquiry. The memorandum too refers to press reports of hearsay evidence published in 1945 and early 1956. These hearsay reports cannot warrant a fresh enquiry. It would be relevant to mention that Prime Minister, Shri Jawaharlal Nehru, had in a letter to Shri Suresh Chandra Bose on May 13, 1962 said: "I cannot send you any precise and direct proof. But all the circumstantial evidence that has been produced and which has been referred to in the Enquiry Committee's Report has convinced us of the fact that Netaji has died. In addition to this, the lapse of time now and the extreme improbability of his being alive secretly when he would be welcome in India with great joy and affection adds to that circumstantial evidence".

Correspondence between Shri Jawaharlal Nehru
and Shri Suresh Bose and Shri Amiya Bose
regarding further enquiry

A set of the letters exchanged between Prime Minister Nehru and Shri Suresh Bose or Shri Amiya Bose are enclosed.

It is true that in his letter of April 22, 1964 Prime Minister Nehru 'agreed' with Shri Amiya Bose that something should be done to "finalise the question of Netaji's death". But he gave no assurance and there is nothing to suggest, in the context of the entire correspondence, that at any time Prime Minister Nehru had

entertained doubts about the conclusive character of the evidence cited by the Shah Nawaz Khan Committee or others to establish Netaji's death. Presumably, what Shri Nehru had in mind was that something should be done to persuade those who still doubted this fact to accept the finality of the conclusion that Netaji was no more.

Decision on the Memorandum

The memorandum was discussed at a meeting of Secretaries held under the chairmanship of the Cabinet Secretary on the 17th February, 1968, to examine the various points raised. As far as the question of a fresh enquiry was concerned, the meeting was of the view that this was not warranted as no fresh evidence had been brought to light. This recommendation was brought to the Prime Minister's notice in connection with unstarred question No. 1408 which was answered in the Lok Sabha on 21.2.1968. In reply to the question, the Prime Minister had stated: "Since no new facts have been brought to light, Government do not consider that any fresh enquiry is warranted".

The suggestions in the memorandum for according honour and recognition to the personality of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose too were examined in the meeting and the recommendations of the meeting, contained in the minutes, have been submitted to the Home Minister and the Prime Minister for approval.

(9)
12

Suresh C. Bose.

Dated 12th May, 1962.

Shri Jawaharlal Nehru,
Prime Minister of India,
New Delhi.

Dear Shri Nehru,

The report in the papers of the 8th instant is to the effect that you stated in Parliament on the previous day, in reply to a question by Shri P.C. Barooah that the majority report of the Netaji Enquiry Committee established that my brother Shri Subhas Chandra Bose, died in an air-accident.

If you hold this piece of news to be correct, it affects the members of our family more than the general public, who, however, are also deeply interested in its correctness or otherwise.

I would, therefore, request you as his elder brother and as the seniormost surviving member of the family to forward to me the proof of his death, circumstances under which such alleged death took place.

In the expectation of a reply and with kind regards,

I remain,

Yours sincerely,

Sd/-Suresh C. Bose
12.5.62.

No.704-PMH/62

May 13, 1962.

Dear Shri Suresh Bose,

I have your letter of the 12th May. You ask me to send you proof of the death of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose. I cannot send you any precise and direct proof. But all the circumstantial evidence that has been produced and which has been referred to in the Enquiry Committee's report has convinced us to the fact that Netaji has died. In addition to this, the lapse of time now and the extreme improbability of his being alive secretly somewhere when he would be welcomed in India with great joy and affection, adds to that circumstantial evidence.

Yours sincerely,

Sd/-Jawaharlal Nehru

Shri Suresh C. Bose,
Garia,
P.O.Garia,
Distt. 24 Paraganas,
West Bengal.

11
14

SURESH C. BOSE

Garia, P.O. Garia,
Dist. 24 Parganas,
(West Bengal),
Dated 8th August, 1962.

Dear Shri Nehru,

It appears from your letter No. 982-PMH/62 of the 26th June last, that your own information conveyed to you by our Ambassadors has confirmed the fact that Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose is dead.

As this piece of news, if true, virtually affects all the members of our family. I would respectfully request you to please forward to me the date, place and circumstances under which the alleged death took place, as reported to you.

With kind regards,

I remain,
Yours sincerely,
Suresh Chandra Bose.

Shri Jawaharlal Nehru,
Prime Minister,
New Delhi.

No.1256-PMH/62

August 12, 1962

Dear Shri Bose,

I have your letter of the 8th August, I wrote to you that all the circumstantial evidence made me believe that Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose had died. Much of this evidence was given in the report made by the Committee appointed for this purpose, which visited Japan. You will find the date, place and circumstances mentioned in that committee's report.

Apart from that report, the length of time that has elapsed is itself confirmatory of the fact of his death.

Yours sincerely,

Jawaharlal Nehru.

Shri Suresh C. Bose,
Garia,
P.O. Garia,
Dist. 24 Parganas.

(16) (13)
1, WOODBURN PARK
CALCUTTA 20

My dear Panditji,

With reference to our talk in Delhi recently, I would like to submit to you the following proposals for your consideration.

The controversy regarding the air crash at Taikoku in August 1945 is having unfortunate consequences. The report of the Enquiry Committee consisting of Shah Nawaz Khan and two other members has not found acceptance among a large section of the Indian people. The main reason for this is to be found in the fact that the Shah Nawaz Enquiry Committee did not include any person of high judicial standing and experience. Irresponsible statements by a number of persons are also keeping this controversy alive. In the national interest there should be a final judicial finding regarding the air crash at Taihoku in August 1945. It will be in the fitness of things if the Chief Justice of India will agree to preside over a body of Judges and enquire into this question. All the materials collected by the Shah Nawaz Enquiry Committee on the subject and other materials that may be available to the Government of India should be placed at the disposal of this body of Judges. This body should, of course, be at liberty to take any further evidence on the subject if that is considered necessary by it and if such evidence is available.

The Government should accept the findings of this judicial body and take whatever steps that may be found necessary on the basis of its recommendations. This being purely a national question the Government should not take into account the opinion of any individual in this matter even though he happens to be related to Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose.

I shall be thankful if you will kindly send me your message in support of the plans of Netaji Hall society.

Hope you are feeling better.

With regards,

Yours sincerely,

Sd/-Amiya Nath Bose.

Shri Jawaharlal Nehru,
Prime Minister of India,
New Delhi.

No.293-PMH/64

14
17
April 22, 1964.

My dear Amiya,

I have your letter of the 20th April,
I agree with you that something should be
done to finalise the question of Netaji's death.
But it is not quite clear to me how far it
will be proper for me to ask the Chief Justice
of India to look into this matter. It may
involve visiting Japan, and I am sure I cannot
ask the Chief Justice to do so.

I have sent you a brief message already
about the Netaji Hall Society.

Yours sincerely,

Jawaharlal Nehru.

Shri Amiya Nath Bose,
1, Woodburn Park.
Calcutta-20.

(4)

SECRET

(15)
18

Netaji Subash Chandra Bose - Removal of his
Ashes from the Renkoji Temple in Tokyo to India.

Netaji Subash Chandra Bose died in an air crash on the 18th August, 1945, at the Taihoku airfield in Formosa. His body was cremated at the Taihoku Crematorium on the 20th August, 1945. The ashes were collected and temporarily kept in the Nishi (West) Honganji Temple, Taihoku till the 7th September, 1945, when they were flown to Tokyo. They have been lying in the Renkoji Temple in Tokyo since then. The Government of India are paying an amount of Rs. 5,000/- per annum to the Head Priest of the Renkoji Temple for the upkeep of Netaji's ashes.

Some doubts were expressed in regard to Netaji's death and, in response to a demand from a section of the public, the Government of India set up an inquiry committee in April, 1956. The Committee consisted of the following:-

- (1) Shri Shah Nawaz Khan
- (2) Shri Suresh Chandra Bose
- (3) Shri S.N. Maitra

A report was submitted by the Committee signed by Shri Shah Nawaz Khan and Shri S.N. Maitra in September, 1956. The conclusion reached by the Enquiry Committee was that Netaji had, in fact, met his death as a result of an air crash. The Committee recommended that Netaji's ashes should be brought to India with due honour and a suitable memorial erected for them.

The third member of the Enquiry Committee, Shri Suresh Chandra Bose, submitted a dissentient report stating that there had been no aeroplane crash and that Netaji had not died as a result.

*What were
his reservations*

The Cabinet considered the Report of the Enquiry Committee on 9th September, 1956 and accepted its findings that Netaji had, in fact, met his death as a result of an air crash. The Cabinet also decided that "the question of bringing over Netaji's ashes to India might be left for future consideration". A copy of the Report was laid on the Table of the House by late Prime Minister Nehru on the 11th September, 1956. He informed the House that the Government had accepted the findings of the Committee. In regard to Netaji's ashes, late Prime Minister Nehru said as follows:

"They (Enquiry Committee) make a recommendation about these ashes, that they should be brought to India with due honour and a suitable memorial erected. So far as the latter part is concerned, the Government do not propose, at this stage, to take any action. This is a matter in which, primarily, the family of Netaji is concerned, and it is with their consultation and goodwill that any step should be taken. I am not prepared to say that it is entirely a family or domestic matter. It is a national matter. Nevertheless, the family is concerned".

There is a body of opinion in India which still continues to doubt the death of Netaji Subash Chandra Bose. Only recently some 350 Members of Parliament asked for a fresh enquiry to establish whether Netaji had, in fact, died in 1945.

As this doubt is raised in the Parliament and outside every now and then, Government have been reluctant to bring the ashes of Netaji to India as that would raise a controversy and might offend the feelings of the family of Netaji.

The question was examined recently when our Ambassador in Tokyo raised this issue after attending the last memorial meeting held at the Renkoji Temple on the anniversary of Netaji Subash Chandra Bose's death. The Ministry of Home Affairs were requested to obtain the understanding of the remaining members of the Bose family to allow Netaji's ashes to be brought back to India with dignity and honour. The Ministry of Home Affairs reached the conclusion that time was not yet ripe for taking any step for the transfer of the ashes of Netaji to India. That Ministry held that there was nothing to indicate that the members of the Bose family had changed their views and were now prepared to accept Netaji as dead. It was felt that, in addition to hurting the feelings of the Bose family, it might also give rise to a country-wide controversy, since many Indians still sincerely believe that Netaji is alive.

The Japanese Government had also approached us through their Embassy in New Delhi for bringing back the ashes to India. At that stage, the position was explained to them. They were also told that the Government of India would continue to pay Rs.5,000/- per annum for the upkeep of the Netaji's ashes at the Renkoji Temple. The Japanese Government seemed to have appreciated our difficulties and were satisfied with the arrangements.

.....

(Ministry of External Affairs(East Asia Division) File
No.C/551/2/68/JP)

Probe panel on Netaji's death

Express News Service

NEW DELHI, Aug 22.

The Home Minister, Mr Y. B. Chavan, told the Lok Sabha today that the question of appointing a Commission to inquire into death of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose was

under a very active consideration of the Government.

Mr Chavan said that the Prime Minister had recently received a memorandum from a large number of Members of Parliament and the matter was being examined.

Mr Chavan, who was replying to a short notice question, said that an idea that there should be a statue of Netaji in the Andamans "with some activity around it" was at present being examined by the Government.

Mr Samar Guha's suggestion that the Andaman and Nicobar islands should be renamed as they were the first territory to be liberated from the British when Netaji made them the head-quarters of the Provisional Government did not find favour with the Government. Mr Chavan said that it would be improper for the Government to decide this; it should be left to the people there to take a decision in the matter.

Move opposed

Mr R. K. Ganesh, who represents the islands in the House, said he did not dispute the role of Netaji in the struggle for freedom but he was opposed to the name being changed. Three-fourths of the houses there had been destroyed by the Japanese fascists and thousands of the people suffered at their hands. Every house bore the scar of the fascist invasion. There were martyrs and heroes who refused to surrender to the Japanese. The islands had a soul and a history which went farther back than that period. Some of them were the progeny of the revolutionaries who had been sent to those islands by the British.

When Mr Guha asked if the destruction had not been before the provisional Government took over the territory. Mr Ganesh said that it was there both before and after.

For some time Mr Ganesh and Mr Guha had angry exchanges and the Speaker, Mr G. S. Dhillon, had to intervene. Mr Dhillon said that he was seriously thinking to have a committee of peacemakers as every little thing seemed to start a dispute in the House.

Suggestions

There were many suggestions about erecting memorials and monuments for Netaji and Mr Chavan promised to look into them. These included having suitable memorials at Port Blair, development of the territory as a "national pilgrimage," annual celebrations there, getting all relevant diplomatic documents from the Japanese Government relating the transfer of the territory to the Provisional Government, statues in the Red Fort, India Gate and portraits in the Central Hall of Parliament and getting information from the Government in Taiwan about the last journey of Netaji.

Some members pointed out that many Indian revolutionaries had died in the islands and there should be a suitable memorial for them as well and the Home Minister said that some suggestions in this regard were under the consideration of the Government.

Mr Jharkhande Rai said that Netaji had promised that the remains of the last Mughal Emperor, Bahadur Shah Zafar, would be taken with military honours to India from Rangoon and this should be done by the Government now. Mr Chavan promised to look into it.

Mr S. M. Bannerjee said that a

non-official Bill suggesting that the ashes of Netaji should be brought to India had been withdrawn in the Lok Sabha when it was felt that Netaji might still be alive. A Commission should, therefore, be appointed to inquire into the matter.

Indian Express
23/8/69

Handwritten notes:
You sh. w. in
this in
parking with
with on the
Rastan
23/8

Handwritten: 23/8

Secret
Copy no. 2
(18)
(21)

(6)

Subject: Disappearance of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose in 1945.

In April 1956, in response to the public demand, Government of India appointed an Enquiry Committee to ascertain the circumstances concerning Netaji's departure from Bangkok on 16.8.45 and his alleged death in an air-crash. The Committee consisted of the following:-

- (i) Shri Shah Nawaz Khan, M.P., Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister of Railways and Transport;
- (ii) Shri Suresh Chandra Bose, elder brother of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose; and
- (iii) Shri S.N. Maitra, I.C.S., formerly Chief Commissioner, Andamans and Nicobar.

The Committee examined witnesses in Delhi, Calcutta, Bangkok, Saigon, Tourane and Tokyo. They also examined books and articles about Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose and studied relevant classified records pertaining to the matter.

2. The members compared and discussed the statements of the witnesses whom they had personally interviewed and took into consideration the evidence from several sources. The three members of the Committee then arrived at certain broad conclusions and unanimously agreed that the report should be written on the basis of these conclusions. These were summarised in a list entitled "Principal points agreed to for Draft Report dated 30-6-1956". This was signed by all the three members of the Committee on 2-7-1956.

3. Shri Suresh Chandra Bose had agreed with the principal conclusions and signed the documents containing these on 2-7-1956. The conclusions confirmed that Netaji had, in fact, met his death in the crash on the 18th August, 1945 at Taihoku. Shri Suresh Chandra Bose, however, submitted a dissentient report stating that there had been no plane crash involving Netaji's death as concluded in the Committee's Report.

4. The Cabinet considered the Report of the Enquiry Committee signed by Shri Shah Nawaz Khan and Shri S.N. Maitra on 9th September, 1956 and accepted the finding that Netaji had, in fact, met his death as a result of the air-crash on 18th August, 1945. The Cabinet also decided that "the question of bringing over Netaji's ashes to India might be left for future consideration."

22

A copy of the Report was laid on the Table of the House by late Prime Minister Nehru on 11th September, 1956 when he informed the House that the Government had accepted the findings of the Committee. The dissentient report too was placed on the Table of the House on 12th December, 1956, and in doing so the Prime Minister again confirmed that the Government had accepted the majority report.

5. Briefly, the conclusions of the majority were that about the spring of 1945 the defeat of the Axis Powers became likely, and Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose began thinking of the future activities of himself on the one hand, and of the Indian Independence League and the Indian National Army on the other. As regards himself, he decided to leave South East Asia and to take refuge in Russia, whence, in due course, he could re-emerge and continue the struggle for India's freedom against the British. As regards the Indian Independence League and the Indian National Army, he appeared to be undecided and desired to consult with his allies, the Japanese, before imparting final instructions.

6. With a view to implementing these intentions he left Bangkok on the 17th August, 1945, for Saigon, whence he had been promised passages for himself and 6 companions by a Tokyo-bound Japanese military plane.

7. At Saigon, however, there was a serious disappointment: only two passages in an Air Force bomber were offered by the Japanese Military Command, which, as a consequence of Japan's surrender to the Allies on the 15th August, 1945, found itself short of air transport. After some discussion Netaji found himself obliged to accept the 2 passages offered, and with the approval of his companions selected Col. Habibur Rehman to accompany him. Netaji and Col. Rehman accordingly took off for Tokyo by the bomber about 5.00 p.m. on the 17th August, 1945.

23

8. Apart from Netaji and Col. Rehman the bomber included 6 Japanese Service Officers as passengers, and a crew of 5 or 6 persons.

9. The bomber landed for the night at Tourane on the Indo-China coast at about 7.30 p.m., and took to the air again with the same inmates at 5.00 a.m. the next morning. The next brief stop was at Taihoku in Formosa in the early afternoon of 18th August, 1945. While taking off from Taihoku later in the afternoon, however, the propeller and the port side engine of the bomber which appears to have been defective even from the start, suddenly dropped out, with the result that the plane immediately crashed about 50 metres off the run-way and burst into flames. Suffering from severe burns Netaji was carried into the Taihoku Military Hospital, where after some hours he passed away.

10. Two days later, on the 20th, his body was cremated in the Taihoku Crematorium. His ashes were collected and temporarily kept in the Nishi (West) Honganji Temple in that city until the 7th September, 1945, when they were flown to Tokyo. There they have since been lying in the Renkoji Temple.

Dissentient
Report

11. The main burden of Shri Bose's dissentient report is that late Prime Minister Nehru had already made up his mind and had agreed to the enquiry only in response to a pressing demand from a large section of the people. Secondly, Shri Bose has charged that two of the members of 3-man Committee were under a "mandate" to arrive at findings which would conform with the pre-conceived notion of the late Prime Minister Nehru that Netaji was dead. He has also charged that he was not taken into confidence by the other two members and was not shown all the relevant material to institute an impartial enquiry. The Committee, he has asked was dominated by the two official members and considered only selective evidence which would only enable them to arrive at the pre-conceived conclusion that Netaji had died in the crash at Taihoku. Shri Bose has gone further to charge that some of the officials of the Government of India had tried to harass and pressurise him into accepting the conclusions of the other two members.

12. Shri Bose mainly picked up small contradictions in details relating to the height of the aircraft, timing of the aircrash, etc.

He also maintained that there was evidence contradicting that there was any air crash at all. This dissentient report was carefully examined by the Government and when laying the report on the table of the House on 12.12.1956, Prime Minister Nehru said that Government adhered to their acceptance of the majority report.

Continuing
rumours
about
Netaji's
survival

13. There have been repeated demands for undertaking another enquiry ever since the Shah Nawaz Khan Committee Report was published. However, Government having accepted the findings of the Committee, have taken the position that unless fresh evidence or new facts were brought to light a further enquiry was not warranted. Rumours about Netaji's survival and whereabouts, etc., have cropped up repeatedly. Each of these, whenever brought to Government's notice, has been investigated and generally found to be baseless. In 1962, rumour was spread that a Sanyasi of Shaulmari Ashram was in fact Netaji. The Sanyasi, Swami Shradhanand himself denied the rumour. Another claim made by Dr. S.N. Sinha that Netaji was incarcerated in Cell No.46 of Yakutusk prison in Siberia has not been corroborated by any tangible evidence. Lt. Gen. Fujiwara of Japan who came to India to present Netaji's sword, while urging for further investigation, did not produce any evidence to contradict the findings of the Shah Nawaz Khan Enquiry Committee. Recently a press report in a Bengali Daily, "Jugantar", based on information given by an ex-Indian army personnel, presently employed in West Bengal Police (as Inspector of Police, Security Control, Calcutta), that Netaji left Singapore by submarine towards the end of 1945 was investigated and found to be hearsay and vague information. The latest instance is of the news report claiming that Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose had spoken from Radio Moscow after the Tashkent Agreement. On checking up with Radio Moscow authorities, it was discovered that a student by the name of Subhas Chandra had in fact made the broadcast.

Correspondence
between
Prime
Minister
Nehru and
Shri Amiya
Bose

14. It has been claimed by Shri Amiya Nath Bose that Prime Minister Nehru, in his letter of April 22, 1964, to him, had accepted that "something should be done to finalize the question of Netaji's death." However, there is nothing to suggest, in the context of the entire correspondence, that at any time Prime Minister Nehru had entertained any doubts about the conclusions

25

the Shah Nawaz Khan Committee Report. Presumably, what Shri Nehru had in mind was that something should be done to persuade those who still doubted this fact to accept the finality of the conclusions that Netaji was no more. Shri Amiya Bose has however claimed that a month before his death, Pandit Nehru had agreed that a proper enquiry Commission should be formed.

Memorandum
by 350 M.Ps

Flag 'A'

15. On December 26, 1967, about 350 Members of Parliament sent a memorandum to the President demanding a fresh enquiry into the reported death of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose. They had urged that further enquiry be made in collaboration with the Governments of Japan and Taiwan. This memorandum was discussed at a Meeting of Secretaries held under the Chairmanship of the Cabinet Secretary on 16th February, 1968 to examine the various points raised. As far as the question of a fresh enquiry was concerned, the meeting was of the view that this was not warranted as no fresh evidence had been brought to light. This recommendation was brought to the Prime Minister's notice in connection with a question in the Lok Sabha on 21.2.68. The Prime Minister, in reply to the question stated that "since no new facts have been brought to light, Government do not consider that any fresh enquiry is warranted.

Recent
requests for
official
Enquiry

Flag OAE

16. Shri Samar Guha wrote in May this year to the Prime Minister requesting for a judicial enquiry on the analogy of the enquiry being conducted in regard to Gandhiji's assassination 20 years after Mahatmaji's death. The Foreign Minister in reply to this letter informed Shri Guha that the terms of reference of the enquiry being conducted into Mahatma Gandhi's assassination did not seek to establish Gandhiji's death. In the letter sent to the Prime Minister by 44 M.Ps, dated August 7, the request for the appointment of a fresh enquiry Commission, consisting of retired Supreme Court judges and eminent public men, has been made on the ground that a fresh probe was being conducted in regard to the assassination of Mahatma Gandhi and that a judicial enquiry was also being conceded in response to a number of M.Ps' request into the cause of death of the Jan Sangh Leader Shri Dindayal Upadhyay. It is quite obvious that these two examples that have been cited are not on all fours with the demand for an enquiry to establish the death of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose.

8

26
MOST IMMEDIATE

No. 23/2/69-Poll.II
GOVERNMENT OF INDIA
MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS

28
D. 10 624-EAD/69
26/8


New Delhi, dated the Aug., 23, 1969.

125/18/69
Subject:- Admitted Resolution given notice of by
Shri Benoy Krishna Daschowdhury, M.P.,
for discussion in Lok Sabha on 29-8-69-
Case for instituting an Enquiry Commission
about the mysterious disappearance of
Netaji Subash Chandra Bose.

...-...

In continuation of this Ministry's O.M. of even
No. dated the 22nd August, 1969, the undersigned is directed
to forward herewith a copy of Lok Sabha Secretariat u.o.
No. 24/2(2)/69/L dated the 20th August, 1969, alongwith its
enclosure, on the subject noted above, and to request that,
as the subject matter of the Resolution is the concern of the
Ministry of External Affairs, they may kindly accept its transfer
and inform the Lok Sabha Secretariat (Legislation Branch)
immediately to their acceptance of the Resolution, under
intimation to this Ministry.

Mr. Avasthi,
pl. speak.
RB
25/8


(R. KuppuRao)
UNDER SECRETARY

To

The Ministry of External Affairs,
(Shri M.K. Manglamurti, Under Secretary),
NEW DELHI.

(Secy B.M. Oza,

OSD)

Room No 242 (South Block)

Spoken.
File has already
gone back to
MHA on 26/8/69
no action
27/8/69

(27) (29)
MOST IMMEDIATE

LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
(Legislative Branch)

A list of admitted resolutions given notice of
by Sarvashri Jyotirmoy Bosu, N.G. Ranga and Benoy Krishna
Daschowdhury, M.Ps., for discussion in the House on the
29th August, 1969 is sent herewith.

Sd/-
(M.K. MATHUR)
for UNDER SECRETARY

Ministry of Labour, Employment and Rehabilitation
(Department of Labour and Employment)

Ministry of Home Affairs

L.S.S. U.O. No. 24/2(2)/69/L, dated the 20th August, 1969.

28 20
RESOLUTION ADMITTED FOR 29-8-1969.

SHRI BENOY KRISHNA DASCHOWDHURY: This House is of opinion that in view of the serious discrepancy in the Shanawaj Enquiry Committee Report and in the absence of any positive evidence about the death of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose, that is a clear case for instituting an Enquiry Commission presided over by a Judge of the Supreme Court of India about the mysterious disappearance of that great national leader since August, 1945, for setting at rest the various speculations still going on in the country and abroad.

9

24/04/2018/3
ल.स.स.टी. जो. 6 28/8

स्थान नई दिल्ली

(29)

दिनांक 28-8-69

, संसद सदस्य ।

D10805-2A0/3
29/8

प्रेषक

सेवा में रामगोपाल शालवाले

सचिव,

लोक-सभा,

नई दिल्ली ।

महोदय,

प्रक्रिया तथा कार्य -संचालन सम्बन्धी नियमों के नियम 197 के

अन्तर्गत में

को अविलम्बनीय लोक

महत्त्व के निम्नलिखित विषय की और

मंत्री का ध्यान दिलाने और मंत्री महोदय से उस पर एक वक्तव्य देने की

प्रार्थना करने की सूचना देता हूँ :-

विदेश-गृह-कार्य

दिल्ली से प्रकाशित एक स्थानीय साप्ताहिक पत्र में प्रकाशित

इस समाचार पर कि पैकिंग राष्ट्रीय जन-कांग्रेस के नव-

निर्वाचित उपाध्यक्ष संभवतः नेताजी सुभाषचन्द्र बोस हैं ।

भवदीय,

सदस्य,
विभाजन संस्था

प्रति :-

1. अध्यक्ष महोदय,

2.

मंत्री